

Minutes of Meeting of the Pravesh Niyran Samiti (Medical Education) held under the Chairmanship of Justice A. C. Agarwal (Retd.) on Saturday, the 25th September, 2010 at 12.30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of confirmed. the Director, Technical Education, 3, Mahapalika Marg, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

- | | | |
|--------------------|---|--------|
| 1. Dr. Ravi Bapat | : | Member |
| 2. Dr. M. S. Kekre | : | Member |

Invitees:

- 1 Shri N.S. Kavede .. Asst. Registrar, MUHS, Nashik & Member Expert Committee
- 2 Dr. A.S. Vyas .. OSD, DMER, Mumbai & Member Expert Committee

Shri Millind Mhaiskar, Member Secretary & Secretary - Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra and Dr. Rajan Welukar, Member have informed about their inability to attend the meeting. However, leave of absence granted to them.

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyran Samiti was present in the meeting.

The copies of the Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members as well as to the invitees.

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm the Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Wednesday, the 1st September 2010 in the Office of Director Technical Education, Mumbai.

The Minutes of the Meeting of the Pravesh Niyran Samiti - Medical Education held on Wednesday, the 1st September 2010 at 12.30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of confirmed. the Director, Technical Education, 3, Mahapalika Marg, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and

The Samiti decides that the decisions which are approved/taken in the meeting shall be communicated to the concerned Departments / Associations and the Colleges / Institutes for further necessary action at their end.

Item No. 2: (a) To review the action taken by the office on the decisions arrived at in the previous meeting.

The Samiti perused the Report submitted in respect of Action taken by the office on the decisions approved/taken by the Samiti in its previous meeting held on 1st September 2010 and the same has been noted and approved by the Samiti, details of which are as below:-

N.E.J.

Item No. 2: (a) To review the action taken by the office on the decisions arrived at in the previous meeting.

Meeting on 1 st September 2010	Actionable Points	Action taken
Item No. 1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti	Minutes of the Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 23 rd September 2010.
Item No. 2(b)	To convey the decisions of the Samiti on review of various CET's / CAP's conducted for AY 2010-11.	The decision of the Samiti is displayed on the web site and Notice Board of the Samiti. The decision is conveyed to the respective Association/College by a separate letter dated 23/09/2010.
Item No. 3	To convey the decision of the Samiti in respect of Third round of ASSO-CET-2010 conducted by AMUPMDC for AY 2010-11	The decision of the Samiti is displayed on the web site and Notice Board of the Samiti. The decision is conveyed to the respective Association by a separate letter dated 23/09/2010.
Item No. 4(a)	Decision on the letter from M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences, Pune regarding conduct of Second CET for its BDS course for AY 2010-11	The decision of the Samiti is displayed on the web site and Notice Board of the Samiti. The decision is conveyed to the respective College/Institute by a separate letter dated 23/09/2010.
Item No. 4(b)	Decision on the letter from DPO's NETT College of Physiotherapy, Thane regarding change of category of 02 students admitted for PT course for AY 2009-10.	The decision of the Samiti is displayed on the web site and Notice Board of the Samiti. The decision is conveyed to the respective College/Institute by a separate letter dated 23/09/2010.
Item No. 4(c)	Decision on the letter from Sinhgad College of Nursing, Pune regarding change of category in respect of Rahul Nirmal Pawar admitted for B.Sc. Nursing Course for AY 2009-10	The decision of the Samiti is displayed on the web site and Notice Board of the Samiti. The decision is conveyed to the respective College/Institute by a separate letter dated 23/09/2010.
Item No. 4(d)	Decision on the letter from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik regarding approval / permission of Samiti for admission to 1 st BHMS course and PG Homoeopathy course	The decision of the Samiti is displayed on the web site and Notice Board of the Samiti. The decision is conveyed to the respective University on 23/09/2010 separately.
Item No. 4(e)	Decision of the Samiti in respect of the eligibility and approval of admission done in A Y 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11.	The decision of the Samiti is displayed on the web site and Notice Board of the Samiti on 23/09/2010.

The Samiti noted the action taken by the Office and approved it.



Item No. 2 (b): To review—Present Scenario – in respect of those who have failed to submit their admission details on or before 20th September 2010.

PRESENT SCENARIO - In respect of those who have failed to submit their admission details on or before 20th September 2010 as directed by Hon'ble Court in W.P. No. 6332 of 2005

Sr. No.	Course	No. of Colleges		No. of Total Colleges under Purview of the Samiti	No. of Colleges who have failed to submit their admission details before 20/09/2010	Cut-off-date
		Pvt. CET	Minority CET			
1	MEDICAL	11	0	11	0	30-Sep-10
2	DENTAL	22	1	23	0	30-Sep-10
TOTAL		33	1	34	0	

Samiti perused the contents of the chart. Samiti directs the colleges to submit the admission lists to PNS within 5 days.

Item No. 3: To consider and decide on the letters /representations received from the following institutions.

- a) **Letter dated 6th September 2010 from N.K.P. A. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences & Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur along with Hon'ble High Court order in Writ Pettiton No.4309 of 2008.**

Samiti noted the contents of Letter dated 6th September 2010 (along with Hon'ble High Court order in Writ Pettiton No.4309 of 2008.) received from N.K.P. A. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences & Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur in respect of admission of Ku. Vijaya Dadala admitted for DGO course in Academic Year 2007-08

After deliberation, Samiti decides to approve the admission only in this case as per the Hon'ble Court's order.

- b) **Letter dated 14th September 2010 received from DPO's NETT college of Physiotherapy, Thane in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 1st Sept. 2010 (at Item No. 4(b)) related to change of category of 2 candidates admitted for PT course for Academic Year 2009-10.**

N.K.P.

Samiti perused the Letter dated 14th September 2010 received from DPO's NETT college of Physiotherapy, Thane in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 1st Sept. 2010 (at Item No. 4(b)) related to change of category of 2 candidates admitted for PT course for Academic Year 2009-10.

Samiti after deliberation decides, to approve these admission subject to the condition that no other candidate from any of the categories suffer any injustice. This will be ensured by the college authorities, and the authorities will submit the written undertaking to that effect to Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti on a stamped paper.

C) Letter dated 8th September 2010 received from Sinhgad College of Nursing, Pune regarding change of category in respect of Mrs. Seema sathe Vujay admitted for PT Nursing Course for Academic Year 2009-10.

Samiti noted the contents of Letter dated 8th September 2010 received from Sinhgad College of Nursing, Pune asking for a change of category in respect of Mrs. Seema sathe Vijay admitted for PT Nursing Course for Academic Year 2009-10. Samiti after deliberation decides to approve the proposal of the college.

d) Letters dated 15th September 2009 received from Godavari College of Nursing, Jalgaon requesting to permit 12 students on the basis of Non-CET for M.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2010-11 and consider the admissions of 02 students viz- Shri Jhon Gleetus and Smt. Gaikwad Pranita Vinay admitted for M.Sc. Nursing course for Academic Year 2009-10 on the basis of B.Sc./P.B.B.Sc. marks respectively.

Samiti perused the Letter dated 15th September 2009 received from Godavari College of Nursing, Jalgaon requesting to permit 12 students on the basis of Non-CET for M.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2010-11 and considering the admissions of 02 students viz- Shri Jhon Gleetus and Smt. Gaikwad Pranita Vinay admitted for M.Sc. Nursing course for Academic Year 2009-10 on the basis of B.Sc./P.B.B.Sc. marks respectively.

After deliberations, Samiti approves the proposal subject to the satisfaction and observance of rules /norms laid down by the council concerned.

Item No.4: To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.

(a) Letter dated 21st September 2010 and 18th September 2010 received from Ayodhya Charitable Trust's College of Audiology & Speech Language Pathology, Pune requesting to admit students on the basis of Non-CET for B.A.S.L.P. Course and requesting to admit the students on the basis of PCM group students respectively for Academic Year 2010-11.

Samiti considered the Letters dated 21st September 2010 and 18th September 2010 received from Ayodhya Charitable Trust's College of Audiology & Speech Language Pathology, Pune requesting to admit students on the basis of Non-CET for B.A.S.L.P. Course and requesting to admit the students on the basis of PCM group students respectively for the Academic Year 2010-11.

Ne J

Samiti after deliberation directs, the admission to be done as per the rules/norms of Rehabilitation Council of India.

(b) Letter dated 17th September 2010 received from Sancheti Inst. For Orthopaedics and Rehabilitation College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to admit the students on the basis of Non- CET for M.P. Th. Course for the Academic Year 2010-11.

Samiti perused the Letter dated 17th September 2010 received from Sancheti Inst. For Orthopedics and Rehabilitation College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to admit the students on the basis of Non- CET for M.P. Th. Course for the Academic Year 2010-11.

Samiti after deliberation accedes to the request made in the letter under reference.

(c) To consider and decide on various complaints received from Students/Parents in respect of the admission process of first year Medical and Dental courses for the Academic Year 2010-11.

i) Samiti perused the complaint received from Dr. D.M. Das against the Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune regarding admission process of FY MBBS course for AY 2010-11

After deliberations Samiti directs to Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune as under --

"After the third round College/ Institute has to publish the vacancy if any in local Newspapers. The College/institute has also to display the vacancy position on website and the Notice Board. The Colleges/Institute will thereafter admit the students merit wise from amongst the applications for admissions received.

Samiti decides not to approve the admissions done by the Colleges/Institute contrary to above.

Samiti further directs the colleges to consider the application of the Gaurav Das (Merit No. 1381) per the merit. Compliance of the same is to be submitted to Samiti at the earliest."

ii) Samiti perused the complaint received from Mr. V.D. Vikhare against the Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune and M.I.M.E.R. Medical College, Pune regarding admission process of FY MBBS course for AY 2010-11

After deliberations Samiti directs to Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune and M.I.M.E.R. Medical College, Pune as under --

"After the third round College/ Institute has to publish the vacancy if any in local Newspapers. The College/institute has also to display the vacancy position on website

Ne. J.

and the Notice Board. The Colleges/Institute will thereafter admit the students merit wise from amongst the applications for admissions received.

Samiti decides not to approve the admissions done by the Colleges/Institute contrary to above.

Samiti further directs the colleges to consider the application of the Ved Deepak Vikhare (Merit No. 3241) per the merit. Compliance of the same is to be submitted to Samiti at the earliest."

iii) Samiti perused the complaint received from Dr. A.Y. Panditrao against the Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune and M.I.M.E.R. Medical College, Pune regarding admission process of FY MBBS course for AY 2010-11

After deliberations Samiti directs to Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune and M.I.M.E.R. Medical College, Pune as under --

"After the third round College/ Institute has to publish the vacancy if any in local Newspapers. The College/institute has also to display the vacancy position on website and the Notice Board. The Colleges/Institute will thereafter admit the students merit wise from amongst the applications for admissions received.

Samiti decides not to approve the admissions done by the Colleges/Institute contrary to above.

Samiti further directs the colleges to consider the application of the Ashwini Anil Panditrao (Merit No. 1481) per the merit. Compliance of the same is to be submitted to Samiti at the earliest."

d) To consider and decide on the Verification Report on the status of NRI candidates admitted during A.Y. 2009-10 and 2010-11 on the basis of documents/relevant papers submitted by the Colleges/Institutes.

The Samiti perused the Verification Report submitted by the Office on the status of the NRI candidates who were admitted in Post Graduate MD/MS, First Year MBBS and BDS course in academic year 2010-11, and 2009-10 respectively. The documents were verified by the Office and checked by the Section Officer.

In consideration of the above, Samiti decides to approve the admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2009-10 and 2010-11, the details of which are as follows:-

Sr.	Name of the College	Name of Student	Candidate Relation with Sponsor.
1	M.I.M.S.R. Medical College, Latur (Total 02 NRI for Post Graduate MD/MS course for A.Y. 2010-11 out of which 01 is approved)	Dr. Sharmeel S. Gandhi	Sponsor is Candidates Real Paternal Uncle

Sr.	Name of the College	Name of Student	Candidate Relation with Sponsor.
2	Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon (Total 01 NRI for FY MBBS course for AY 2010-11)	Ishita Subhash Patil	Sponsor is Candidates Cousin Brother
3	M.I.M.S.R. Medical College, Latur (Total 01 NRI for FY MBBS course for AY 2010-11)	Mr. Shaikh Mukhtadir Yakub	Sponsor is Candidates Real Maternal Uncle
4	Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri (Total 13 NRI for A.Y. 2009-10 out of which 10 is approved)	Sayyed Safiya Mehmood	Sponsor is Candidates Real Maternal Uncle
		Mayekar Abhishek Vinayak	Sponsor is Candidates Uncle
		Giri Bhumika Bhagwant	Sponsors is Candidates Uncle
5	S.D. Kalmegh Smruti Dental College, Nagpur (Total: 15 NRI for FY BDS Course for A.Y. 2009-10)	Bhagyalaxmi Kulmethi	Sponsor is Candidates real Maternal cousin sister
		Harleen Bhatiya	Sponsor is Candidates Uncle
		Tanushree Pawar	Sponsor is Candidates Niece
		Smruti Raut	Sponsor is Candidates Uncle
		Ashwini Ilame	Sponsor is Candidates Cousin Brother

After deliberations, Samiti decides not to approve the admissions of the NRI candidates, on the basis of remarks / reasoning given by the office in respect of the following Institutes/Colleges , the details of which are as follows:

Sr.	Name of the College	Name of the Student	Candidate Relation with Sponsor.	Observation
1	Sanjeevan Medical Foundation E.N.T. Postgraduate Training Inst., Miraj (Total 01 NRI for Post Graduate MD/MS course for A.Y. 2010-11)	Dr. Anirudh Shulka	Sponsor is Candidates Maternal Aunt	Relation between candidate and Sponsor is not proved.
2	M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune (Total : 08 NRI for AY 2009-10 for FY BDS course out of which 06 is approved)	Nikita Sushil Gupta	Sponsor is Candidates Uncle	Relation between candidate and Sponsor is not proved.
		Saiyukta Pravin Hirve	Sponsor is Candidates Sisters Husband	NRI Status of Sponsored as well as Relation between candidate and Sponsor is not proved.

Handwritten signature

Sr.	Name of the College	Name of the Student	Candidate Relation with Sponsor.	Observation
3	S.D. Kalmegh Smruti Dental College, Nagpur (Total: 15 NRI for FY BDS Course for A.Y. 2009-10)	Syeda Zafrin	Relation not mention	NRI Status of Sponsored as well as Relation between candidate and Sponsor is not proved.
		Pallavi Shrirang Sawal	Sponsor is Candidates Cousin	Relation between candidate and Sponsor are not proved.
4	S.D. Kalmegh Smruti Dental College, Nagpur (F.Y. BDS course for AY 2008-09)	Priya Pusushottam Chopde	Sponsor is Candidates Cousin Brother	NRI Status of Sponsored is not proved.
5	S.D. Kalmegh Smruti Dental College, Nagpur (Total 01 NRI for F.Y. BDS course for AY 2006-07)	Miss. Rimisha O. Agarwal	Sponsor is Candidates Cousin	Relation between candidate and Sponsor are not proved.
6	Shri Bhagwan Homoeopathic College, Aurangabad (Total 01 NRI for PG Homoeopathic course for AY 2009-10)	Dr. Ketki Mirajgaonkar	Sponsor is Candidates Cousin Brother	Relation between candidate and Sponsor are not proved.

(e) To consider and decide on the Report of Expert Committee in respect of eligibility and approval of admission done in Academic Year 2009-10 and 2010-11.

Samiti noted the contents of the report; details of which are as under--

Sr.	Name of the College	Observation
1.	Sancheti Inst. For Orthopaedics, Pune (APGM-CET-2010)	10 Candidates are selected for academic year 2010-11. No. discrepancy found. Two candidates (Dr. Vivek & Dr. Puneet) are selected in NRI quota. PNS may verify the NRI status of these two candidates.
2.	Kakasaheb Mhaske Hom. Medical College, Ahmednagar (APGH-CET- 2009)	15 Candidates are selected in Regular Course. No discrepancy found. Three candidates (Hulawale Sanket, Patil Swapanali & Chana Abdul) are selected in NRI status of these candidates. 38 candidates are selected in External Course. No discrepancy found. Seven candidates are selected in NRI Quota for External Course. PNS may verify the NRI status of previously stated candidates.

M. J.

Sr.	Name of the College	Observation
3.	Kakasaheb Mhaske Hom. Med. College, Ahmednagar (APGH-CET-2008)	37 Candidates are selected for External Course in regular quota. Still college has not provided CET data of one candidate (Upendra Reddy.) Now no discrepancy found in remaining 36 candidates. 7 candidates are selected in NRI Quota. PNS may verify the NRI quota. No discrepancy found in his admission.
4.	DKMM Hom. Med. College, Aurangabad (APGH-CET-2008)	36 candidates are selected for External Course in regular quota. Out of these, 11 candidates have secured less than requisite marks. PNS may verify the selection of these 11 candidates on the basis of CCH norms (CCH notification dated 31 st Oct. 2001 & APGH-CET 2008 information brochure Clause no. 11.9)
5.	NDMVPS College of Physiotherapy, Nashik (APGP-CET-2009)	PNS may verify the eligibility of BPTH marks of Samuel Selvakumar. No discrepancy found in selection of C. Nagrajan.
6.	NDMVPS College of Physiotherapy, Nashik (ASSO-CET-2009)	30 Candidates are selected for academic year 2009-10. No discrepancy found.

After deliberation Samiti decides that, where there are no discrepancies such admissions stand approved, where there are discrepancies such proposals to be kept before Samiti after removal of the discrepancies.

The next meeting of the Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on Monday, the 11th October 2010 at 12.30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Director, Technical Education, Mumbai - 400 001.

Date: 7th October 2010


(A. C. AGARWAL)
CHAIRMAN